

CHARLES F. RICHARDS (010428)  
RICHARDS LAW OFFICE, P.C.  
1515 E. Missouri Avenue, Suite 201  
Phoenix, AZ 85014-2432  
[cfr@rlopc.com](mailto:cfr@rlopc.com)  
602-277-8449  
602-277-8447 (fax)

PAMELA DUNLOP GATES (*Pro Hac Vice Admitted -8-30-2023*)  
Texas State Bar No. 06239800  
CORPORATE LITIGATION  
CNA  
5801 Headquarters Drive, Suite 750A  
Plano, Texas 75024-6189  
[pamela.dunlopgates@cna.com](mailto:pamela.dunlopgates@cna.com)  
214.220.5921 –Direct Dial  
214.220.5902 – Facsimile  
Attorneys for Defendant National Fire Insurance Company of Hartford

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA

Pulte Home Company, LLC, a Michigan  
limited liability corporation, on behalf of  
itself and as successor by conversion of  
Pulte Home Corporation, a Michigan  
corporation,

Plaintiffs,

v.

Midwest Family Mutual Insurance  
Company, an Iowa corporation; United  
Specialty Insurance Company, a Delaware  
corporation; Knight Specialty Insurance  
Company, a Delaware corporation; The  
Cincinnati Indemnity Company, a  
Delaware corporation; Liberty Mutual Fire  
Insurance Company, a Wisconsin  
corporation; Wausau Underwriters  
Insurance Company, a Wisconsin  
corporation; Starr Surplus Lines Insurance  
Company, an Illinois corporation;  
Endurance American Insurance Company,

Case No. 4:23-cv-00167-CKJ

**NOTICE OF SETTLEMENT AS TO  
ALL MATTERS BETWEEN  
PLAINTIFF AND NATIONAL FIRE  
INSURANCE COMPANY OF  
HARTFORD**

(Assigned to the Honorable Cindy K  
Jorgenson)

1 a Delaware corporation; Pennsylvania  
 2 Lumbermens Mutual Insurance Company,  
 3 a Pennsylvania corporation; First Mercury  
 4 Insurance Company, an Illinois  
 5 corporation; Clarendon National Insurance  
 6 Company, as successor in interest by way  
 7 of merger with Sussex Insurance Company  
 8 fka as Companion Property and Casualty  
 9 Insurance Company, a Texas corporation;  
 10 First Specialty Insurance Corporation, a  
 11 Missouri corporation; Peleus Insurance  
 12 Company, a Virginia corporation; United  
 13 Fire & Casualty Company, an Iowa  
 14 corporation; Wesco Insurance Company, a  
 15 Delaware corporation; Travelers Property  
 16 Casualty Co. of America, a Connecticut  
 17 corporation; The Travelers Indemnity  
 18 Company of America, a Connecticut  
 19 corporation; Colorado Casualty Insurance  
 20 Company, a New Hampshire corporation;  
 21 National Fire Insurance Company of  
 22 Hartford, an Illinois corporation; BITCO  
 23 National Insurance Company, an Illinois  
 corporation; James River Insurance  
 Company, an Ohio corporation; NGM  
 Insurance Company, a Florida corporation;  
 Valley Forge Insurance Company, a  
 Pennsylvania corporation; Allied World  
 Assurance Company (US) Inc., a  
 Delaware corporation; Twin City Fire  
 Insurance Company, an Indiana  
 corporation; Safety National Casualty  
 Corporation, a Missouri corporation; and  
 QBE Insurance Corporation, a  
 Pennsylvania corporation,  
 Defendants.

24 Pulte Home Company, LLC (“Pulte”) and National Fire Insurance Company of  
 25 Hartford (“National Fire”), by and through their undersigned counsel, hereby notify the  
 26 Court that all issues in this lawsuit have been settled between Pulte and National Fire. All  
 27 requirements for final settlement are expected to be completed within 45 days of this  
 28

1 Notice and, within that time, the parties expect that Pulte will file with the Court a  
2 voluntary stipulation of dismissal of National Fire with prejudice.

3 Dated this 21st day of November, 2023

4 Respectfully submitted,

5 PAYNE & FEARS LLP

6 /s/ Sarah J. Odia

7 Scott S. Thomas, Bar No. 21-275

8 Sarah J. Odia, Bar No. 21-279

9 PAYNE & FEARS LLP

4 Park Plaza, Suite I I 00

Irvine, California 92614

10 Phone (949) 851-1100

11 Fax (949) 851-1212

[sst@paynefears.com](mailto:sst@paynefears.com)

12 [sjo@paynefears.com](mailto:sjo@paynefears.com)

13 Attorneys for Plaintiff, Pulte Home  
Company, LLC

14 -AND -

15 RICHARDS LAW OFFICE, P.C.

16  
17 By: /s/ Charles F. Richards

CHARLES F. RICHARDS

18 1515 E. Missouri Avenue, Suite 201

19 Phoenix, AZ 85014-2432

Attorneys for Defendant National Fire  
Insurance Company of Hartford

20  
21 Of Counsel:

Pamela Dunlop Gates (*Pro Hac Vice Admitted 08-30-2023*)

22 CORPORATE LITIGATION

CNA

23 5801 Headquarters Drive, Suite 750A

Plano, Texas 75024-6189

24 [pamela.dunlopgates@cna.com](mailto:pamela.dunlopgates@cna.com)

214.220.5921 –Direct Dial

25 214.220.5902 – Facsimile

Attorneys for Defendant National Fire Insurance Company of  
26 Hartford

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned certifies that on November 21, 2023, I electronically transmitted the foregoing *Notice of Settlement as to All Matters Between Plaintiff and National Fire Insurance Company of Hartford* to the Clerk's Office using the United States District Court for the District of Arizona's CM/ECF System for filing and for transmittal of a Notice of Electronic Filing to the following, who are CM/ECF registrants:

Sarah J. Odia, Esq. Attorneys for Pulte Homes Company, LLC  
Scott S. Thomas, Esq.  
PAYNE & FEARS LLC  
2375 East Camelback Road, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Phoenix, AZ 85016  
T: 602.344.9549  
F: 602.344.9653  
[sjo@paynefears.com](mailto:sjo@paynefears.com)  
[sst@paynefears.com](mailto:sst@paynefears.com)

Brent R. Phillips, Esq. Attorneys for Midwest Family Mutual  
PHILLIPS LAW CORPORATION Insurance Company; Starr Surplus Lines  
112 North Central Avenue, 1st Floor Insurance Company  
Phoenix, AZ 85004  
T: 602.258.0110  
F: 714.586.5499  
[bphillips@phillipslawcorporation.com](mailto:bphillips@phillipslawcorporation.com)

Amy M. Samberg, Esq. Attorneys for Travelers Property Casualty  
Amanda R. Hough, Esq. Co. of America; The Travelers Indemnity  
CLYDE & Co. US LLP Company of America; United Fire &  
400 East Van Buren Street, Suite 440 Casualty Company  
Phoenix, AZ 85004  
T: 480.746.4562  
F: 480.746.4556  
[amy.samberg@clydeco.us](mailto:amy.samberg@clydeco.us)  
[amanda.hough@clydeco.us](mailto:amanda.hough@clydeco.us)

Christopher J. Bork, Esq. Attorneys for The Cincinnati Specialty  
Gary L. Hudson, Jr., Esq. Underwriters Insurance Company  
CHILDERS HANLON & HUDSON, PLC  
722 East Osborn Road, Suite 100  
Phoenix, AZ 85014  
T: 602.254.1444  
F: 602.266.0691  
[cbork@chhazlaw.com](mailto:cbork@chhazlaw.com)  
[glhudson@chhazlaw.com](mailto:glhudson@chhazlaw.com)

1 Lesley W. Robertson, Esq.  
2 ROBERTSON & ASSOCIATES, APC  
3 550 West C Street, Suite 580  
4 San Diego, CA 92101  
5 T: 619.531.7000  
6 F: 619.531.7007  
7 [lrobertson@robertsonapc.com](mailto:lrobertson@robertsonapc.com)

Attorneys for Clarendon National  
Insurance Company

6 Jennifer M. Bahling, Esq.  
7 Kevin C. Barrett, Esq.  
8 BARRETT & MATURA, P.C.  
9 8925 East Pima Center Parkway, Suite 215  
10 Scottsdale, AZ 85258  
11 T: 602.792.5705  
12 F: 602.792.5710  
13 [kbarrett@barrettmatura.com](mailto:kbarrett@barrettmatura.com)  
14 [jbahling@barrettmatura.com](mailto:jbahling@barrettmatura.com)

Attorneys for NGM Insurance Company

12 Laleaque Grad, Esq.  
13 SKANE MILLS LLP  
14 600 B Street, Suite 1500  
15 San Diego, CA 92101  
16 T: 619.702.1635  
17 F: 619.702.1645  
18 [lgrad@skanemills.com](mailto:lgrad@skanemills.com)

Attorneys for First Specialty Insurance  
Corporation

17 Megan E. Ritenour, Esq.  
18 Jay R. Graif, Esq.  
19 FREEMAN, MATHIS & GARY, LLP  
20 4343 North Scottsdale Road, Suite 150  
21 Scottsdale, AZ 85251  
22 T: 602.805.9564  
23 [megan.ritenour@fmglaw.com](mailto:megan.ritenour@fmglaw.com)  
24 [jay.graif@fmglaw.com](mailto:jay.graif@fmglaw.com)

Attorneys for Peleus Insurance Company

23 Josh I. Keane, Esq.  
24 BLAU | KEANE LAW GROUP, P.C.  
25 128 Center Street  
26 El Segundo, CA 90245  
27 T: 310.410.1900  
28 F: 310.410.1901  
[josh@blaulaw.net](mailto:josh@blaulaw.net)  
[elena@blaulaw.net](mailto:elena@blaulaw.net)

Attorneys for United Specialty Insurance  
Company and Knight Specialty Insurance  
Company

1 Jennifer Rebholz, Esq.  
2 John H. Podesta, Esq.  
3 Kimberly D. Pye, Esq.  
4 WILSON ELSEER MOSKOWITZ  
5 EDELMAN & DICKER  
6 2231 East Camelback Road, Suite 200  
7 Phoenix, AZ 85016  
8 T: 480.562.3674  
9 F: 480.562.3659  
10 [jennifer.rebholz@wilsonelser.com](mailto:jennifer.rebholz@wilsonelser.com)  
11 [john.podesta@wilsonelser.com](mailto:john.podesta@wilsonelser.com)  
12 [kimberly.pye@wilsonelser.com](mailto:kimberly.pye@wilsonelser.com)

Attorneys for Allied World Assurance  
Company (US) Inc.

9 Jasmina Richter, Esq.  
10 SANDERS + PARKS  
11 3030 North Third Street, Suite 1300  
12 Phoenix, AZ 85012  
13 T : 602-532-5779  
14 F: 602-230-5035  
15 [Jasmina.Richter@sandersparks.com](mailto:Jasmina.Richter@sandersparks.com)

Attorneys for James River Insurance  
Company

14 Gustavo A. Otalvora, Esq.  
15 BATESCAREY LLP  
16 191 North Wacker, Suite 2400  
17 Chicago, IL 60606  
18 [gotalvora@batescarey.com](mailto:gotalvora@batescarey.com)

Attorneys for BITCO National Insurance  
Company

18 Karen C. Stafford, Esq.  
19 Victoria R. Kelly, Esq.  
20 THE CAVANAGH LAW FIRM, P.A.  
21 1850 North Central Avenue, Suite 1900  
22 Phoenix, AZ 85004  
23 T: 602.322.4000  
24 [kstafford@cavanaghlaw.com](mailto:kstafford@cavanaghlaw.com)  
25 [vkelly@cavanaghlaw.com](mailto:vkelly@cavanaghlaw.com)

Attorneys for Liberty Mutual Fire  
Insurance Company, Wausau Underwriters  
Insurance Company; First Mercury  
Insurance Company

1 Elizabeth S. Fitch, Esq.  
2 Melissa Lin, Esq.  
3 RIGHI FITCH LAW GROUP  
4 2999 North 44th Street, Suite 215  
5 Phoenix, AZ 85018  
6 T: 602.385.6776  
7 F: 602.385.6777  
8 [beth@righilaw.com](mailto:beth@righilaw.com)  
9 [melissa@righilaw.com](mailto:melissa@righilaw.com)

Attorneys for Endurance American  
Insurance Company

10 Charles F. Richards, Jr., Esq.  
11 Richards Law Office, P.C.  
12 1515 East Missouri Avenue, Suite 201  
13 Phoenix, AZ 85014  
14 T: 602.277.8449  
15 F: 602.277.8447  
16 [cfr@rlopc.com](mailto:cfr@rlopc.com)

Attorneys for National Fire Insurance  
Company of Hartford and Valley Forge  
Insurance Company

17 Pamela Dunlop Gates, Esq.  
18 CNA Corporate Litigation  
19 Plaza of the Americas  
20 700 North Pearl Street, Suite 450  
21 Dallas, TX 75201  
22 T: 214.220.5921  
23 F: 214.220.5902  
24 [pamela.dunlopgates@cna.com](mailto:pamela.dunlopgates@cna.com)

25 /s/ Pamela Dunlop Gates

26 Pamela Dunlop Gates  
27  
28